VALERIO DE OLIVEIRA MAZZUOLI

THE LAW OF TREATIES

A COMPREHENSIVE STUDY OF THE 1969 VIENNA CONVENTION AND BEYOND

Foreword
PAULO PINTO DE ALBUQUERQUE
Judge of the European Court of Human Rights
THE LAW OF TREATIES
GEN | Grupo Editorial Nacional is the largest publishing platform in the scientific, technical and professional sectors. It is engaged in the publication of works in the fields of health, exact sciences, juridical sciences, applied sciences, human sciences and public competitions. Furthermore, it provides services for the educational area, continuing medical training and preparation for competitions. Visit our catalogue comprised of over five thousand works and three thousand e-books available at www.grupogen.com.br.

The companies that make up the GEN Group, which are highly respected in the publishing market, developed unparalleled catalogues as a result of their published works, which play a key role in the field of academic training and continuing education of several generations of professionals and students of Management, Law, Nursing, Engineering, Physiotherapy, Medicine, Dentistry, Physical Education and many other sciences, having become a synonym for trustworthiness and respect.

Our mission is to provide readership with the best scientific content and distribute it in a flexible and convenient fashion, at fair prices, yielding benefits for, and serving the interest of, authors, teachers, booksellers, officers, employees and shareholders.

Our unconditional ethical behavior and our social and environmental responsibility are strengthened by the educational nature of our activity, without jeopardizing the continued growth and profitability of the group.
EDITORA FORENSE is responsible for any flaws that its products may have concerning their edition (i.e., their printing and presentation, enabling the consumer to handle and read them without issue). Neither the publisher nor the author assumes any possible responsibility or liability for any damage or loss sustained by any person or property that might arise from the use of this work.

All rights reserved. In accordance with the provisions of the copyright legislation, total or partial reproduction of any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, is prohibited, including by xerographic processes, photocopying and recording, without prior permission in written form from the author and the publisher.

Printed in Brazil

English translation of the 2nd Brazilian edition by Diego Luis Alonso
Exclusive rights protected in Brazil concerning the English language version
Copyright © 2016 by

EDITORA FORENSE LTDA.
A publishing house part of GEN | Grupo Editorial Nacional
Travessa do Ouvidor, 11 – CEP. 20040-040 – Rio de Janeiro – RJ (Brazil)
Phone: +55 (21) 3543-0770 – Fax: +55 (21) 3543-0896
faleconspc@grupogen.com.br | www.grupogen.com.br

Any owner of rights whose work is fraudulently reproduced, disseminated or used in any other way may apply for the seizure of the copies or the suspension of their dissemination, without prejudice to whatever indemnification that may be applicable (Section 102 of Act no. 9610, 19.02.1998). Any person who, for the purposes of sale or securing any direct or indirect gains, advantages or profits for herself/himself or for a third party, sells, displays for sale, receives and conceals, acquires, distributes, stores or uses a fraudulently reproduced work or phonogram shall be severally liable along with the infringer in accordance with the provisions of foregoing Sections; in the event the reproduction has been carried out abroad, the importer and the distributor shall be held accountable for such an infringement (Section 104, Act no. 9610/98).

Book cover: Danilo Oliveira

Cataloging in publication (CIP) – Brazil.
Sindicato Nacional dos Editores de Livros (Brazilian Union of Publishers), Rio de Janeiro (RJ) – Brazil.

M429L
Mazzuoli, Valério de Oliveira, 1977-


Original title: Direito dos Tratados
Text in English
Includes Bibliography

1. Public International Law. I. Title.

15-27260 CDU: 341.9
So bene che è merito d’un libro il dar la volontà di sapere più di quello che insega.

Foreword
(to the First Brazilian Edition)

Dr. Valerio de Oliveira Mazzuoli has published a new title that is added to his long and impressive list of works on Public International Law. This new work is a thematic monograph on the Law of Treaties. The author in the context of this work elaborates on the general theory of treaties following the pattern established by the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties of 1969. As a result thereof, the work deals with the procedure of formation, conclusion, formulation of reservations and amendments of international treaties, as well as the entry into force and termination of international acts. Moreover, in a separate part of the work, the author also addresses specific issues related to treaties as set forth in the 1986 Vienna Convention itself. The work concludes with the analysis of the procedure for the conclusion of international treaties, and the solutions of the conflicts which may arise between treaties and domestic law under the 1988 Brazilian Constitution. In addition to a refined compilation of bibliographic references, this work contains the most relevant conventional instruments regarding the law of treaties, a table showing the current status of the 1969 Vienna Convention amongst the States having ratified it, as well as the Guide of the International Law Commission of the United Nations (2011) to Practice on Reservations to Treaties.

Undoubtedly, this is a fundamental work for the Portuguese-speaking world in the field of public international law academic writing. It stands alongside the most valuable contributions made by French, Italian, Anglo-Saxon and German legal scholars. The reasons for this are three-fold: firstly, this work does not sidestep discussions of the most sensitive and intractable dogmatic issues of Public International Law relating to international treaties. The author analyses these problems both from a static and a dynamic perspective, asserting his personal positions based upon solid arguments. Secondly, this work constitutes an updated commentary on the entire Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties. It should also be noted that this is the first Brazilian work of this sort whereby the Convention is analysed in its entirety, after its ratification by the Brazilian government in 2009. Last but not least, thirdly, it should be stated that this work
stands out as a result of the ideology that reflects the dogmatic options chosen by the author. Following other works already published and, especially, his brilliant doctoral thesis, the author adopts a clearly favourable stance on international law, conceiving the law of nations as a “dialogue of sources”, which basically reflects the value of a true “dialogue of differences”. The final line of argument regarding the jurisdictional control of conventionality and supra-legality of municipal law puts the finishing touch on a robust dogmatic thinking, which in an immaculate Cartesian logic concludes that “unconventional constitutional norms” exist.

At a time where mankind faces up to significant political, economic and social challenges, international law academic writings become of utmost importance for conventional boundaries of States’ action to be pondered over, defined and determined. Treaties at large and, in particular, international treaties on human rights constitute the most progressive source of current Public International Law. On the one hand, the scope of international treaties has been enlarged to encompass any subject matter domain, as evidenced, for instance, by the treaties adopted by Council of Europe, which amount to more than two hundred instruments. On the other hand, treaties have been construed and applied by a wide variety of international tribunals and similar bodies of a quasi-judicial nature as though they were a “living body of law” (corps vivant) in the words of the European Court of Human Rights. Given that treaties constitute bodies endowed with a life of their own, and independent of the will of the States, they can be subject to a continuously updated and teleological interpretation, which in turn circumscribes the discretion of Signatory States to determine and rule upon their provisions, while at the same time they can be adapted to the new circumstances of the political and social life of the peoples.

This commendable work of Dr. Valerio de Oliveira Mazzuoli reflects the immense scientific wealth inherent in all international treaties, fully warranting the dogmatic approach adopted by the author in analysing this subject matter in a stand-alone work.

Strasbourg, September 2011.

Paulo Pinto de Albuquerque
Judge of the European Court of Human Rights
Doctorate of Law, Catholic University of Lisbon
Associate Professor with tenure, Faculty of Law, Catholic University of Lisbon
Adjunct Professor, Illinois College of Law, United States of America,
and visiting Professor, Jiao Tong University, Shanghai, China
Member of the International Institute for Human Rights René Cassin
Acted as an Expert of the Group of States against Corruption (GRECO),
appointed by the Council of Europe
Information to the Readership

This English edition faithfully reflects the 2nd edition of this book published in Portuguese in May 2014 by the century-old publishing house, Editora Forense.

I prepared this edition with great enthusiasm, with a view to addressing every single aspect of the Law of Treaties as it stands today. Furthermore, my purpose was to write this book in the most didactic fashion, subjecting it to any in-depth and scientifically rigorous analyses that may have been necessary. Overall, I focused on examining the very essence of each issue under analysis, always linking theory to practice. Furthermore, I organized the entirety of theory of treaties (especially with regard to the formation, continuance in force and termination of international acts) mirroring the 1969 Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties.\(^1\) Special consideration was given (which pervades throughout the text) to the Brazilian practice relating to the conclusion of treaties; moreover, an entire part of the book deals with the procedural steps that must be complied with according to the Brazilian constitution in order to conclude treaties and the ensuing conflicts that may arise between treaties and domestic law.

After several years of working on this book, I feel that I was able to carry out an original study on the theory and practice of treaties, which is also capable of providing practical answers to recurring issues, especially in the current historical context.

The interpretation carried out, with respect to the articles of the Vienna Convention, reflects my own convictions as it could not have been otherwise. Thus, on all topics dealt with throughout this book I expressed my personal understanding, which will be noticed \textit{at first sight} by any attentive

\(^1\) Throughout the book, reference is made to the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties between States and International Organizations or between International Organizations, 1986 (particularly, with respect to common issues with the 1969 Vienna Convention). Furthermore, an entire part of the book (Part IV) deals with the 1986 Vienna Convention, without addressing the \textit{theory} of treaties, since in this work such an analysis is carried out only in connection with the 1969 Convention (the study of which is practically used in its entirety to understand the 1986 Conventions, after some minor adjustments). As mentioned Part IV only deals with specific issues regarding the 1986 Vienna Convention.
reader. The generous bibliography consulted, which was gathered in various parts of the world and in the most diverse occasions, made me realize that scholarly writings, in general, address some topics from a widely accepted perspective, while other topics give rise to a great disparity of opinions and views that goes well beyond reasonable bounds… Nevertheless, in this book, I follow my own line of thought, which sometimes falls in with the majority of legal writers, although very often it carves out its own path, which diverges from what the majority of legal scholars may have elaborated on a particular matter.2 In short, I have always believed that an author should be accountable for his/her own work, and in this context it should be no different.

Throughout the tables in this book, distinct fonts were inserted in order to either show peculiarities about the topic under consideration, or draw attention to a particular quote from an author, that is deemed to be important in a given context, or sometimes set examples of specific issues that are being dealt with in that part of the book. Furthermore, I added in the first three Annexes, which are placed at the end of the book, the official versions of the three conventions governing the study carried out in this work. In the fourth Annex I included the current table (officially published by the United Nations) of the 1969 Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, where the number of States that has ratified it can be verified, together with the interpretative statements or reservations that have been made, as well as the objections to the reservations raised by several States. The fifth and last Annex contains the Guide of the International Law Commission of the United Nations (2011) to Practice on Reservations to Treaties.

Lastly, it should be noted that this book is particularly useful not only for law students and practitioners, but also International Relations scholars, diplomats, consular officers, stakeholders involved in commercial activities, political scientists, sociologists, researchers in related fields, etc.

To conclude, I should thank the GEN Group for its on-going commitment in the publication of this work, and in particular, Oriene Pavan, Giselle Tapai and Henderson Fiirst, who contributed to the publication of this work without delay. Furthermore, a special thanks goes to Diego Luis Alonso for translating this work into English. Without their contribution, this edition would certainly not have been possible.

São Paulo, January 2016.

The Author

---

2 Let us take, by way of example, the subject matter dealt with in Chapter 2, Part III on “Defects in Consent an in International Acts”.
Summary

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS USED .......................................................... XIX
INTRODUCTION ................................................................................................ XXI

PART I
GENERAL THEORY OF TREATIES

Chapter 1
CONCEPT OF INTERNATIONAL TREATY

1.1 Historical background ............................................................................. 3
1.2 Codification of the law of treaties ........................................................ 6
1.3 The Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties .................................... 10
1.4 Concept of treaty .................................................................................... 16
  1.4.1 International agreement ................................................................. 18
  1.4.2 Concluded in written form ............................................................. 20
  1.4.3 Concluded between States or international organizations ............ 22
  1.4.4 Governed by international law ....................................................... 25
  1.4.5 Whether embodied in a single instrument or in two or more related
       instruments ....................................................................................... 26
  1.4.6 Absence of a particular designation ............................................... 27
1.5 Treaty terminology .................................................................................. 28
1.6 The issue of Memoranda of Understanding (MOUs) ............................... 41
1.7 Soft law instruments .............................................................................. 48

Chapter 2
CLASSIFICATION OF TREATIES

2.1 Formal classifications ............................................................................. 53
  2.1.1 Considerations regarding the number of parties ............................ 54
  2.1.2 Considerations regarding the type of procedure for their conclusion .. 57
  2.1.3 Considerations concerning the possibility to access to a treaty ....... 60
2.2 Material classifications ........................................................................... 61
  2.2.1 Considerations concerning the legal nature .................................... 62
  2.2.2 Considerations concerning implementation over time ................. 66
2.2.3 Consideration concerning territorial implementation .............................................. 67
2.2.4 Considerations concerning the implementation mechanism ........................................ 68
2.3 Plan of the following parts of this work ........................................................................... 69

PART II
GENESIS OF INTERNATIONAL TREATIES

Chapter 1
PROCEDURE OF FORMATION AND CONCLUSION OF TREATIES

1.1 Introduction ....................................................................................................................... 73
1.2 International and internal stages ....................................................................................... 74
1.3 Conditions of validity ....................................................................................................... 75
  1.3.1 Capacity of negotiating States .................................................................................. 76
  1.3.2 Signatories authorization and full powers ................................................................. 80
  1.3.3 Mutual consent ......................................................................................................... 86
  1.3.4 Lawfulness and material possibility of object or purpose ........................................ 87
1.4 Preparation of the conventional text ............................................................................. 88
  1.4.1 Negotiations .......................................................................................................... 89
    1.4.1.1 Distinction regarding the type of treaty .............................................................. 90
    1.4.1.2 Procedure followed in international organizations or ad hoc international conferences ................................................................. 92
    1.4.1.3 General rule of good faith negotiations ............................................................. 93
  1.4.2 Adoption of the text ................................................................................................. 94
    1.4.2.1 Rules for the adoption of the text ..................................................................... 95
    1.4.2.2 Differentiations ................................................................................................. 96
    1.4.2.3 Full powers for adoption ................................................................................. 97
  1.4.3 Authentication ......................................................................................................... 98
1.5 Expression of consent ..................................................................................................... 102
  1.5.1 Signature ................................................................................................................. 104
    1.5.1.1 Concept ............................................................................................................ 105
    1.5.1.2 Legal nature ...................................................................................................... 105
    1.5.1.3 Full powers upon signature ............................................................................. 107
    1.5.1.4 Signature with ratification effect ....................................................................... 109
    1.5.1.5 Deferred signature ........................................................................................... 112
    1.5.1.6 Obligations arising from signature ................................................................... 113
  1.5.2 Ratification ............................................................................................................. 118
    1.5.2.1 Concept ............................................................................................................ 121
    1.5.2.2 Legal nature ...................................................................................................... 123
    1.5.2.3 Silent treaties .................................................................................................... 125
1.5.2.4 Procedure ................................................................. 127
1.5.2.5 Characteristics ............................................................ 130
  1.5.2.5.1 Governmental act of international nature ............... 131
  1.5.2.5.2 Express act ..................................................... 133
  1.5.2.5.3 Political and circumstantial act......................... 134
  1.5.2.5.4 Discretionary act............................................ 135
  1.5.2.5.5 Act of non-retroactive nature........................... 138
  1.5.2.5.6 Irrevocable act............................................. 139
  1.5.2.5.7 No time limits .............................................. 139
  1.5.2.5.8 Possibility or impossibility of carrying out a conditional ratification ................................. 141
1.5.3 Accession .................................................................. 141
1.6 Structure of treaties ..................................................... 146

Chapter 2
RESERVATIONS TO MULTILATERAL TREATIES

2.1 Introduction .................................................................. 151
2.2 Reservations to bilateral treaties? .................................. 154
2.3 Concept and formulation of reservations .......................... 156
2.4 Moment of formulation of reservations ............................ 160
2.5 Limitations on reservations ............................................ 163
2.6 Procedure regarding reservations ................................... 173
2.7 Distinction between reservations and other acts not implying a reservation ... 176
2.8 Acceptance of and objection to reservations ........................ 182
2.9 Effects of reservations .................................................. 188
2.10 Withdrawal of reservations or objections .......................... 189
2.11 Interpretation of reservations ........................................... 192
2.12 The problem of reservations (and amendments) at the internal level .... 193
2.13 Addendum: consideration of the matter of reservations and interpretative declarations in case of succession of States ........................................ 196

Chapter 3
ENTRY INTO FORCE OF TREATIES

3.1 Entry into force and provisional application of treaties .......... 199
  3.1.1 Entry into force of treaties ......................................... 199
  3.1.2 Provisional application of treaties ................................ 203
3.2 Registration and publication of treaties ............................... 206
3.3 Observance and application of treaties ............................... 210
  3.3.1 Observance (or compliance) of treaties ......................... 210
PART III
CONTINUANCE IN FORCE AND TERMINATION OF TREATIES

Chapter 1
TREATIES IN FORCE

1.1 Effects of treaties on the parties ......................................................... 229
  1.1.1 External effects ........................................................................... 230
  1.1.2 Internal effects .......................................................................... 231
1.2 Effects of treaties on third parties ...................................................... 233
  1.2.1 Diffuse effect of recognizing an objective legal situation ............... 234
  1.2.2 Factual impact of a given treaty on third States........................... 236
  1.2.3 Legal effect of imposing obligations and granting rights to third States
       1.2.3.1 Treaties providing for obligations for third States .................. 238
       1.2.3.2 Treaties providing for rights for third States ...................... 241
1.3 Effects of treaties that have not yet entered into force on contracting parties
       and third parties ............................................................................ 245
1.4 Amendment and modification of treaties ............................................. 246
  1.4.1 Amendment of treaties ................................................................. 246
  1.4.2 Modification of multilateral treaties ............................................ 251
  1.4.3 Internal law procedure ............................................................... 255
1.5 Interpretation of treaties .................................................................... 256
  1.5.1 General interpretation rule .......................................................... 257
  1.5.2 Supplementary means of interpretation ....................................... 262
  1.5.3 Interpretation of treaties authenticated in two or more languages .... 266
  1.5.4 Interpretation systems ................................................................ 268
       1.5.4.1 International interpretation ............................................... 269
       1.5.4.2 Internal interpretation ..................................................... 272
       1.5.4.3 Interpretation by legal scholars .......................................... 274
  1.5.5 Interpretation of treaties on human rights .................................... 274
1.6 Conflict between successive treaties .................................................. 275
  1.6.1 Prevalence of the UN Charter and norms of jus cogens .................. 278
  1.6.2 The problem of compatibility clauses ........................................ 279
  1.6.3 Successive treaties relating to the same subject-matter with identical
       parties ............................................................................................ 282
1.6.4 Successive treaties relating to the same subject-matter with different parties ................................................................. 284

1.6.5 Conclusion on the Convention system ........................................ 285

1.7 Concurrence of treaties with a later customary rule ...................... 286

---

Chapter 2

DEFECTS IN CONSENT AND IN INTERNATIONAL ACTS

2.1 Defects in consent and invalidity of treaties .................................... 290

2.1.1 Avoidability of consent ................................................................. 292

2.1.1.1 Error .......................................................................................... 293

2.1.1.2 Fraud ......................................................................................... 295

2.1.1.3 Corruption of a representative of a State .................................. 296

2.1.2 Invalidity of consent ...................................................................... 297

2.1.3 Invalidity of treaties ...................................................................... 300

2.2 Jus cogens and invalidity of treaties .................................................. 305

2.2.1 What are norms of jus cogens? ..................................................... 307

2.2.2 Conflict between treaties and norms of jus cogens ....................... 312

2.2.2.1 Conflict between a treaty and an earlier norm of jus cogens ... 312

2.2.2.2 Conflict between a treaty and a subsequent norm of jus cogens ........................................................................... 314

2.2.2.3 Conflict between a treaty and a norm of jus cogens existing before entry into force of the Vienna Convention .................. 317

2.2.3 Hierarchy of norms of jus cogens in the law of treaties .................. 318

2.3 Unconstitutionality of treaties .......................................................... 319

2.3.1 Constitutional approach ............................................................... 320

2.3.2 International approach ................................................................. 322

2.3.3 Conciliatory approach ................................................................. 323

2.3.4 Solution adopted by the 1969 Vienna Convention .......................... 324

2.3.5 Intrinsic unconstitutionality of treaties ........................................ 330

---

Chapter 3

TERMINATION AND SUSPENSION OF TREATIES

3.1 Termination of treaties ...................................................................... 336

3.1.1 Termination by consent of the parties ........................................... 336

3.1.1.1 Predetermined abrogation ....................................................... 337

3.1.1.1.1 Expiration of the agreed term .............................................. 337

3.1.1.1.2 Condition subsequent ......................................................... 338

3.1.1.1.3 Full performance of treaty object and purpose ................. 339

3.1.1.2 Supervening abrogation ......................................................... 340
3.1.1.2.1 Termination by the vote of a given number of parties........................................................................ 341
3.1.1.2.2 (Implicit or tacit) Termination by a later treaty........ 342
3.1.2 Termination by unilateral will (denunciation)................................. 343
  3.1.2.1 Denunciation in the 1969 Vienna Convention...................... 344
  3.1.2.2 The problem of denunciation in Brazilian Law.................. 348
3.1.3 Extrinsic grounds for termination .............................................. 356
  3.1.3.1 Material breach of a treaty ............................................. 357
  3.1.3.2 Supervening impossibility of performance.......................... 361
  3.1.3.3 Fundamental change of circumstances.............................. 364
  3.1.3.4 Severance of diplomatic or consular relations.................... 369
  3.1.3.5 State of war ................................................................... 370
  3.1.3.6 Disuse (obsolete) ............................................................ 372
3.2 Suspension of the operation of treaties............................................. 373
  3.2.1 Suspension by the agreement of the parties............................. 374
  3.2.2 Suspension by unilateral will .............................................. 375
  3.2.3 Extrinsic grounds for suspension......................................... 376
  3.2.4 Suspension of treaties and the Brazilian Law......................... 377

Chapter 4
PROCEDURE TO BE FOLLOWED WITH RESPECT TO DEFECTS,
INVALIDITY, TERMINATION OR SUSPENSION

4.1 Procedure relating to defects in consent, invalidity, termination, withdrawal
or suspension of the operation of a treaty........................................ 379
  4.1.1 Procedure under the 1969 Vienna Convention.......................... 380
  4.1.2 Particularities of the 1986 Vienna Convention........................ 386
4.2 Consequences of vitiated consent, invalidity, termination and suspension of
the operation of a treaty................................................................ 388
  4.2.1 Consequences of invalidity of a treaty and vitiated consent........ 389
  4.2.2 Consequences of the termination of a treaty.......................... 390
  4.2.3 Consequences of the suspension of the operation of a treaty....... 392

PART IV
TREATIES IN THE 1986 VIENNA CONVENTION

Chapter 1
GENERAL RULES OF THE 1986 CONVENTION

1.1 Introduction.................................................................................... 397
1.2 History and current situation of the 1986 Convention.................... 398
1.3 Similarities between the 1969 and 1986 Conventions ............................................. 400
1.4 Relationship between the 1986 Convention and the 1969 Convention .................. 402
1.5 Situation of the Vienna Convention of 1986 in Brazil ........................................... 404

Chapter 2
TREATIES UNDER THE CONVENTION OF 1986

2.1 Capacity of international organizations to conclude treaties ................................ 405
2.2 Some treaties included in the 1986 Convention ...................................................... 406
  2.2.1 Headquarters agreements .................................................................................. 406
  2.2.2 Agreements on privileges and immunities ....................................................... 407
  2.2.3 Agreements for the creation of bodies related to the organization in States .................. 407
  2.2.4 Agreements to organize meetings and promote cooperation between international organizations ........................................................................................................ 408
  2.2.5 Agreements to give conferences of international organizations in States .................. 408
2.3 Questions not prejudged by the 1986 Convention .................................................. 408

PART V
TREATIES AND INTERNAL LAW

Chapter 1
CONSTITUTIONAL PROCEDURAL ASPECTS ON THE CONCLUSION OF TREATIES IN BRAZIL

1.1 Introduction .............................................................................................................. 413
1.2 The 1988 Brazilian Constitution and the treaty-making power ............................... 417
1.3 The issue of treaties concluded in simplified form .................................................. 418
1.4 The relationship between the Executive Power and Legislative Power in the treaty-making process .......................................................................................................... 427
1.5 The role of the National Congress in the treaty-making process .............................. 435
   1.5.1 The expression “decide definitively” used in the Constitution ......................... 436
   1.5.2 The question of “charges or commitments encumbering the national patrimony” ........................................................................................................... 440
1.6 Internal procedure in the Houses of the National Congress .................................. 443
1.7 Brazilian practice for the entry into force of treaties ............................................. 446
   1.7.1 Final agreement and deposit ............................................................................ 446
   1.7.2 Promulgation .................................................................................................... 449
   1.7.3 Publication ....................................................................................................... 457
1.8 Effects of the internal adoption of treaties in the national legal system .................. 460
1.9 Public authorities responsible for the execution of treaties .................................... 461
Chapter 2

CONFLICT BETWEEN TREATIES AND RULES OF INTERNAL LAW

2.1 The case of Brazil ............................................................ 463
2.2 Regulatory parity of ordinary treaties declared by the SFC .................. 466
2.3 Our opinion as to the position of the SFC .................................. 472
2.4 Jurisdictional control of the conventionality of laws ...................... 478
   2.4.1 The doctrine of conventionality control in the Inter-American system . 480
   2.4.2 Conventionality control in Brazilian Law ................................ 484
       2.4.2.1 Concentrated control of conventionality ............................. 485
       2.4.2.2 Diffuse control of conventionality .................................... 488
   2.4.3 Control of supralegality ................................................... 490
2.5 Some sensitive issues on the application of treaties in Brazil ............ 492

REFERENCES ............................................................................. 495

ANNEXES

Annex I
Havana Convention on Treaties (1928) ............................................. 517

Annex II

Annex III
Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties between States and International Organizations or between International Organizations (1986) .................. 547

Annex IV

Annex V
Guide to Practice on Reservations to Treaties (2011) ......................... 615

LIST OF OTHER PUBLISHED WORKS OF THE AUTHOR .................. 645
### Abbreviations and Acronyms Used

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Add.</td>
<td>Addendum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADECON</td>
<td>Ação Declaratória de Constitucionalidade [Declaratory Action of Constitutionality]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADIn</td>
<td>Ação Direta de Inconstitucionalidade [Direct Action of Unconstitutionality]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADPF</td>
<td>Arguição de Descumprimento de Preceito Fundamental [Allegation of Disobedience of a Fundamental Precept]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALADI</td>
<td>Latin American Integration Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Art.</td>
<td>article</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arts.</td>
<td>articles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIICL</td>
<td>British Institute of International and Comparative Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cf.</td>
<td>Confront/compare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ch.</td>
<td>Chapter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cit.</td>
<td>cited earlier</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>coord.</td>
<td>coordinator(s)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DAI</td>
<td>Divisão de Atos Internacionais do Ministério das Relações Exteriores [International Acts Division of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doc.</td>
<td>Document</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ed.</td>
<td>editing/editor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ed.</td>
<td>Editora [Publishing House]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>eds.</td>
<td>editors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.g.</td>
<td>exempli gratia (for example)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>et al.</td>
<td>and others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>etc.</td>
<td>et cetera</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fasc.</td>
<td>fascicle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GATT</td>
<td>General Agreement on Tarifs and Trade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>Habeas Corpus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ibidem</td>
<td>same page(s)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICC</td>
<td>International Criminal Court</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICJ</td>
<td>International Court of Justice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICJ Reports</td>
<td>Reports of Judgments, Advisory Opinions and Orders of the International Court of Justice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>idem</td>
<td>same book/work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i.e.</td>
<td>id est (that is)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Introduction

Since the establishment of Public International Law as an autonomous discipline, *treaties* have become the most important subject matter. No public international law scholar has ever denied that this is the source *par excellence* of the law of nations, there being nowadays no other set of norms deemed to be more important than a treaty.\(^3\) It is not difficult to realize that there exists a true *primacy of treaties* when the usage of a treaty is compared to that of any other international acts in writing, such as an *agreement* or a *Memorandum of Understanding* between foreign Powers. Said otherwise, all States (and international organizations also) agree that the legal instrument called *treaty* continues to be the *general rule* at an international level, where they aim at setting a specific norm or a body of norms, which effectively regulates their relationship. The astonishing growth of the *United Nations Treaty Series* clearly reflects this fact, demonstrating – beyond all doubt – the significant role played by treaties nowadays.\(^4\)

Unlike municipal law, which has multiple mechanisms to set out legal norms, the means used by International Law to establish rights and obligations amongst States or international organizations are relatively simple. If compared to municipal law, international law is “much more


restricted in regard with the norm-setting mechanisms; but it is not less true that the latter is more secure than the former. Furthermore, international norm setting through the conclusion of treaties is also a more practical mechanism. Whilst under municipal law there are specific provisions (set out in National Constitutions) to regulate certain specific matters, under the law of nations, subject-matters of the most varied kinds (provided that their objects are licit) are regulated by means of the same legal instrument, that is, a treaty. Hence, Joseph Nisot’s teaching to the effect that treaties are “la source la plus certaine du droit international”. It is true that the above statement could seem nowadays rather obvious, except for the fact that Brazil waited for more than 40 years in order to ratify the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, since its signing (that took place at the United Nations Conference on the Law of Treaties, in the Austrian Capital) on 23 May 1969.

Primacy of the legal instrument – treaty – still remains over customs, which governed the law of nations throughout human history until the beginning of the twentieth century. This assertion is confirmed by the conclusion of the 1969 Vienna Convention itself, which recognized in its Preamble, “the fundamental role of treaties in the history of international relations” (first recital), “the ever-increasing importance of treaties as a source of international law and as a means of developing peaceful cooperation among nations, whatever their constitutional and social systems” (second recital) and, particularly – with respect to the primacy of treaties over customs –, “that the rules of customary international law will continue to govern questions not regulated by the provisions of the present Convention” (eighth recital). The common denominator among such

---

7 See Annex IV.
9 The eighth recital was a result of the proposed amendment submitted by Switzerland regarding the draft articles of the 1969 Conference Drafting Committee, with the support of Brazil. The 1961 Vienna Convention on Diplomatic Relations and the 1963 Vienna Convention on Consular Relations, both concluded prior to the 1969 Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, contain an identical recital in their respective Preambles: “...the rules of customary international law continue to govern matters not expressly regu-
recitals is the underlying truth, i.e. the legal instrument – *treaty* overrides customary law as far as *certainty* is concerned. So much so, the matters until then governed exclusively by customary rules are at present (almost all of them) regulated by treaties. Therefore, treaties have been used in order to regulate a great variety of matters, ranging from the exploration of outer space, the establishment of rules governing intellectual property, the protection of living marine resources, the regulation of investments or the effective carrying out of an extradition process.

The conclusion of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties constituted the most significant step in the codification process of contemporary international law, particularly, taking into account the relevance of the subject dealt with, concerning (since the entry into force of the Convention, on 27 January 1980) any and every treaty. Moreover, at a time when governance of the international society is almost exclusively ruled by the conclusion of treaties, the continuance in force of the 1969 Convention represents a safe harbour for the international players regarding the great variety of issues that nowadays are being discussed in the international arena. In the case of Brazil, the ratification of the Convention that took place on 25 September 2009 marks the definitive entry of this country (albeit late) into this *new era* that the international society is going through, and national academic writings shall support these new developments.

Nevertheless, like any other human work, the 1969 Vienna Convention is not exhaustive. In fact, some issues were not dealt with in the Convention, e.g., the effects of treaties in the event of succession of States and under the state of war; furthermore, issues related to treaties concluded between States and international organizations or between international organizations themselves were not addressed either. The Convention, however, did address other matters, but not in a satisfactory manner, such as, especially, the institution of reservations to treaties. In this particular case, some provisions of the Convention had to be left aside many times – although, in a very careful way – in order to acquire a better understanding of the issue concerned, which should be read together with the guidelines laid out in the Guide of the ILC (2011) (see Part II, Cap. 2, below).

---

It should be noticed that here the analysis of the Law of Treaties – or the theory of treaties, as it is also known – is carried out in strictly formal terms. Its understanding does not relate, a priori, to the object or purpose of any particular agreement, that is, the content of a certain norm. The present research deals with any and every treaty, covering the whole of the international acts (either bilateral or multilateral ones) concluded by and between States and/or international organizations. Certainly, from time to time, reference will be made to a specific type of treaty, such as, a peace treaty, a friendship treaty, an arbitration treaty, a cooperation treaty, an extradition treaty, a navigation treaty, and so forth. Throughout this work, special consideration will occasionally be given to treaties dealing with the protection of human rights, including conventions for the protection of civil and political rights, and economic, social and cultural rights, as well as those conventions dealing with labour and environmental rights.\footnote{11} However, this book has not been contrived to make the reader believe that those instruments shall be analysed in particular or in their material aspects. Such an analysis would go far beyond the scope of the Law of Treaties.\footnote{12}

The present study basically examines \((a)\) how States or intergovernmental organizations negotiate, \((b)\) which are the organs responsible for these negotiations, \((c)\) how a conventional text is adopted, \((d)\) what the form to ensure the authenticity of the text is, \((e)\) how contracting parties express their consent to be bound by an agreement, \((f)\) how a treaty (and its provisional application) enters into force \((g)\) how a treaty is incorpo-
rated into the national legal order, (h) what the defects capable of nullifying the consent to be bound by a treaty or the treaty itself are, (i) what the effects of an agreement on the contracting parties or third parties are, and (j) how international acts are terminated.

In addition to these strictly international aspects of the theory of treaties, there also exist other aspects related to the internal legal systems, to which due consideration will be given, as could not be otherwise, from a Brazilian legal system perspective. The latter subject examined throughout Part V of the this book, which begins (Ch. 1) by dealing with the Brazilian constitutional procedural steps for the conclusion of treaties, and ends by addressing the resolution (Ch. 2) of conflicts that may arise between a treaty and a municipal norm, at which point the issue of jurisdictional control of conventionality of domestic laws will also be addressed.
Part I

General Theory of Treaties